

Lesson Title: Haymarket Conclusion – Direct Lesson and Inquiry Lesson

Standards:

NCSS Themes:

- I. Culture
- II. Time, Continuity, and Change
- V. Individuals, Groups, and Institutions
- VI. Power, Authority, and Governance
- VII. Civic Ideals and Practices

Illinois Learning Standards:

Goal 16: Understand events, trends, individuals, and movements shaping the history of Illinois, the United States, and other nations.

A. Apply the skills of historical analysis and interpretation.

16. A.4b Compare competing historical interpretations of an event.

16.A.5a Analyze historical and contemporary developments using methods of historical inquiry (pose questions, collect and analyze data, make and support inferences with evidence, report findings).

B. Understand the development of significant political events.

16.B.4b (W) Identify political ideas from the early modern historical era to the present which have had worldwide impact.

C. Understand the development of economic systems.

16.C.5b (US) Analyze the relationship between an issue in United States economic history and the related aspects of political, social and environmental history.

Objectives:

By the end of this lesson, students will:

1. Understand the effects of the Haymarket Affair on the labor movement.
2. Know how to use the historical inquiry process.

Materials/Equipment:

- o Chalk/marker board
- o Chalk/marker
- o PowerPoint or transparencies including:
 - images of Lingg's suicide,
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act4/shadowOfTheGallows/shadowOfTheGallows_f.htm
 - illustration, "The Chicago Anarchists Pay the Penalty of their Crime,"
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act4/powerfulSilence/powerfulSilence_f.htm
- o Historical inquiry format (for Haymarket conclusion)
- o Paper, colored pencils for posters and political cartoons
- o Gompers, Samuel (head of AFL). "Why the AFL Defended the Chicago Anarchists." *Seventy Years of Life and Labor*. New York, 1925. (p. 134 of Haymarket Scrapbook)
- o Terrence Powderly (head of Knights of Labor) Selection from "Anarchy and the Knights." *Thirty Years of Labor: 1859-1889*. Philadelphia: 1890. Republished, New York: Augustus M. Kelley, 1967. p. 286.

- o Leslie Orear interview (first interview)
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/personalRecollections/personalRecollections_f.htm
- o Photograph, paper mache statue of Louis Lingg on empty pedestal. Roediger, Dave, & Franklin Rosemont, eds. *Haymarket Scrapbook*. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr Publishing Co., 1986. p. 239
- o “Visions of Waldheim” photographs and accompanying information (info attached to this document)
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/landmarkStatus/landmarkStatus_f.htm
- o “Honoring the Police” photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act5/mourningAndMemory/mourningAndMemory_f.htm
Note: Teacher may want to cut this one if more resources exist than students.
- o “Monument on the Move” photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/toServeAndProtect/toServeAndProtect_f.htm
- o “Eugene Victor Debs” photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/tellingsAndRetellings/tellingsAndRetellings_f.htm
Note: Teacher may want to cut this one if more resources exist than students.
- o “The International Stage” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/tellingsAndRetellings/tellingsAndRetellings_f.htm
- o “The Struggle Continues” photograph and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “Contested Site” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “Rallying Point” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “Centennial Commemoration” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “Conference and Exhibition” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “Whose Truth?” artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
- o “A Modest Marker” photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm

Procedures:

Pre-class Preparation:

1. Prepare PowerPoint or overheads with images for lecture.
2. Ensure students have access to resources, including digital images, accompanying information, and Quicktime movie, for historical inquiry analysis; could be done by using computer lab, or making copies and allowing students to watch movie on teacher computer.
3. Make copies of historical inquiry analysis worksheets.

Anticipatory Set:

- For the past few days, we’ve been discussing the Haymarket Affair, and today we are going to find out how the story ends – sort of. First of all, we should find out how it ended in the short term. Does anyone have predictions on how the trial ended? The verdict? If they were found guilty, what do you think the punishment would be? (Write predictions on side of board.)
- But, one hundred and thirty years later, it really hasn’t ended yet. Can anyone predict what might have happened to perpetuate that? (Write predictions on side of board.)

Objectives:

By the end of today's class you will:

- know how the Haymarket Affair turned out in the short term
- know the effects of the Haymarket Affair in the long term, up through today
- have more practice with the historical inquiry process

Outline of Lesson Contents:

1. *Review of what we know:*

Let's do a quick review of what we know about the Haymarket Affair. (Have students give suggestions of what they remember and take notes on board. Fill in important details they have forgotten as you go.)

2. *What do we want to know:*

Does anyone remember what I said you would know by the end of class today? (Help them remember day's objectives.) First we are going to look at Haymarket's short term outcome.

3. *Haymarket's short-term outcome mini-lecture:*

The eight anarchists were tried before a jury of middle-class and native-born men comprised largely of salesmen, small businessmen, and clerks. One, Oscar Neebe, was sentenced to fifteen years at hard labor (the case against him was weak). The other seven were condemned to death. Appeals were unsuccessful. Most of the anarchists were opposed to requesting clemency for a crime they contended they did not commit from an authority they despised. However, two, Samuel Fielden and Michael Schwab, did appeal and were granted clemency. (*Show images of Lingg's suicide, http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act4/shadowOfTheGallows/shadowOfTheGallows_f.htm*) As the execution date neared, on Nov. 10, Louis Lingg attempted suicide by placing a smuggled explosive in his mouth and lighting the fuse. He suffered horribly for several hours until he finally died. The same day, Governor Oglesby commuted Fielden's and Schwab's sentences. (*Show illustration, "The Chicago Anarchists Pay the Penalty of their Crime," http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act4/powerfulSilence/powerfulSilence_f.htm*) On Nov. 11, the remaining four men were led to the gallows, draped in shrouds, and the nooses placed around their necks. They were allowed their final words. Spies asserted, "The time will come when our silence will be more powerful than the voices you are throttling today." Fisher and Engel both shouted, "Hurrah for anarchy!" Fisher then defiantly declared, "This is the happiest moment of my life!" Parsons was attempting to make a longer address to the crowd when the trap door fell. The men died slowly from suffocation, as their necks did not break from the fall. In 1893, Governor Atgeld granted an absolute pardon to the men who remained in prison.

Q: So, were our predictions for the short-term outcomes correct?

4. *Inquiry process to determine long-term effects: Pose Questions*

So, let's move on to the other question of the day. We are going to use the historical inquiry process to investigate it. (Pass out inquiry analysis sheets.) Let's see if we remember how to do this.

Q: What should our question be? What are the event, time, place, and group to be investigated? Is the question open-ended?

5. *Inquiry process to determine long-term effects: Collect and Analyze Data*

Have students break into pairs or on own, to evaluate assigned resource, filling in table in section C of inquiry analysis.

Resources:

1. Gompers, Samuel (head of AFL). "Why the AFL Defended the Chicago Anarchists." *Seventy Years of Life and Labor*. New York, 1925. (p. 134 of Haymarket Scrapbook)
2. Terrence Powderly (head of Knights of Labor) Selection from "Anarchy and the Knights." *Thirty Years of Labor: 1859-1889*. Philadelphia: 1890. Republished, New York: Augustus M. Kelley, 1967. p. 286.
3. Leslie Orear interview (first interview)
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/personalRecollections/personalRecollections_f.htm
4. Photograph, paper mache statue of Louis Lingg on empty pedestal. Roediger, Dave, & Franklin Rosemont, eds. *Haymarket Scrapbook*. Chicago: Charles H. Kerr Publishing Co., 1986. p. 239
5. "Visions of Waldheim" photographs and accompanying information (info attached to this document)
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/landmarkStatus/landmarkStatus_f.htm
6. "Honoring the Police" photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act5/mourningAndMemory/mourningAndMemory_f.htm
Note: Teacher may want to cut this one if more resources exist than students.
7. "Monument on the Move" photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/toServeAndProtect/toServeAndProtect_f.htm
8. "Eugene Victor Debs" photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/tellingsAndRetellings/tellingsAndRetellings_f.htm
Note: Teacher may want to cut this one if more resources exist than students.
9. "The International Stage" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/tellingsAndRetellings/tellingsAndRetellings_f.htm
10. "The Struggle Continues" photograph and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
11. "Contested Site" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
12. "Rallying Point" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
13. "Centennial Commemoration" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
14. "Conference and Exhibition" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
15. "Whose Truth?" artifacts and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm
16. "A Modest Marker" photographs and accompanying information
http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/aCenturyAndCounting/aCenturyAndCounting_f.htm

6. Inquiry process to determine long-term outcomes and effects: Make and Support Inferences with Evidence

List "types of effects" on the board, cite sources under each category. (Note: effects of Haymarket include: impeding success of 8 hour day movement, causing serious damage to Socialist movement, providing rallying cause for the labor movement, collective forgetting that Haymarket "martyrs" were anarchists rather than trade unionists, continued vandalism to Haymarket monuments in names of contemporary causes, etc.)

Q: What are some of the most common, and therefore strongest, outcomes and effects?

Q: What sources did we use to come to each of these inferences?

Have students fill in section C of inquiry analysis sheet with these findings.

7. Inquiry process to determine long-term effects: Report Findings

Have students create posters or political cartoons showing a long-term effect or outcome of the Haymarket Affair. You may want to have them choose whichever effect/outcome is most interesting to them, or break it up so that each effect/outcome is represented. The art can then be displayed on classroom walls to remind students of the continued effect of the past.

Evaluation:

Students will be evaluated upon quality of summary and analysis of their assigned resource. If working in groups, participation could be evaluated. Attention to group analysis effort should be evaluated according to quality of notes taken on other students' summaries and analyses of resources, and notes on outcomes/effects and sources

name: _____

**historical inquiry format
(for Haymarket conclusion)**

a. pose questions

Record question.

Identify event: _____

time, _____

place, _____

group to be investigated _____

and check for question being open-ended. Yes / No

b. collect and analyze data

Source	Summary	Effect shown
1 Gompers, Samuel (head of AFL). "Why the AFL Defended the Chicago Anarchists."		
2 Terrence Powderly (head of Knights of Labor) Selection from "Anarchy and the Knights."		
3 Leslie Orear		

interview		
4 Photograph, paper mache statue of Louis Lingg on empty pedestal.		
5 “Visions of Waldheim”		
6 “Honoring the Police”		
7 “Monument on the Move”		
8 “Eugene Victor Debs”		
9 “The International Stage”		
10 “The Struggle Continues”		
11 “Contested Site”		

12 “Rallying Point”		
13 “Centennial Commemoration”		
14 “Conference and Exhibition”		
15 “Whose Truth?”		
16 “A Modest Marker”		
17		

d. report findings

Create a poster or political cartoon that represents a long-term effect or outcome of the Haymarket Affair. Primarily use graphics; use words as necessary but don't rely upon them.

Visions of Waldheim additional information:

By dawn on Saturday, November 12, the day after the hangings, mourners and the curious filled the Milwaukee Avenue neighborhood where the bodies were placed on view. An enormous crowd assembled the following day to watch the funeral coaches bear the dead and grieving to the railroad station for the journey to Waldheim Cemetery, about ten miles west of downtown in the suburb of Forest Park. In spite of some objections from the managers of the cemetery, the gravesite quickly assumed the status of a shrine, the semiofficial locus of ceremonies of remembrance and resistance. Almost immediately plans began for the erection of a monument, and in December of 1887 the Pioneer Aid and Support Association was founded to raise funds for this project and to assist relatives of the deceased. On June 25, 1893, yet another procession of several thousand people marched through the downtown and then boarded the train to dedicate the completed monument at Waldheim. Fourteen-year-old Albert Parsons Jr. lifted the veil off sculptor Albert Weinert's hooded figure of justice and liberty facing the future resolutely as she places a laurel wreath on the brow of a fallen worker.

<http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/act5/act5.htm>



An irony surrounding more recent protests of commemorations of Haymarket in this country is the criticism they have received from the radical left, even though such commemorations are now almost invariably prolabor occasions. One of the most recent scenes in the dramas of Haymarket was the ceremony on May 3, 1998, marking the designation of the Waldheim monument site as a National Historic Landmark. Landmark status had been approved in 1997, and the plaque placed near the monument explained that it "represents the labor movement's struggle for workers' rights." Once again the speakers were dominated by labor leaders, with the keynote address given by the president of the Chicago Federation of Labor, who criticized the latest instances of what he termed corporate greed and disregard for the welfare of workers. Present also were descendants of the martyrs, a representative of the National Park Service, the combined German-American Chorus of Chicago, and the German consul.



But when actress Alma Washington, dressed as Lucy Parsons, unveiled the plaque, self-declared anarchists created a brief disturbance when they spat on the brass tablet and berated the crowd for permitting the Haymarket defendants to be "honored" by the very government that martyred them. By this time many union representatives and their rank-and-file, while still deeply concerned about the attempts by American business interests to weaken the position of the worker, were also likely to take a fairly conservative stand on issues of law and order and police authority.

<http://www.chicagohistory.org/dramas/epilogue/epilogue.htm>